OFFICE OF THE	HEARING EXAMINER
CITY C	DF TACOMA
TIMOTHY BAERG,	HEX2023-003
Appellant, v. CITY OF TACOMA, ANIMAL CONTROL AND	FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW, DECISION AND ORDER
COMPLIANCE, Respondent.	
THIS MATTER came on for hearing	g on May 18, 2023, ¹ before JEFF H. CAPELL, the
Hearing Examiner for the City of Tacoma, W	ashington. Deputy City Attorney Jennifer Taylor
represented the City of Tacoma, Animal Con-	trol and Compliance ("Animal Control" or
"ACC") at the hearing. Timothy Baerg ("App	bellant" or "Baerg") appeared at hearing pro se.
Witnesses were sworn and testified. Exhibits	were submitted and admitted, and arguments
were presented and considered.	
Witnesses testifying at the hearing we	ere as follows:
 Mara Gimse; Eric O'Donnell ACC Officer; Timothy Baerg.² 	and
From the evidence in the hearing reco	rd, the Hearing Examiner makes the following:
	meeting restrictions were lifted, however, the Appellant ring was conducted over Zoom at no cost to any participan eferred to by last name only hereafter. No disrespect is
FINDINGS OF FACT,	City of Tacoma Office of the Hearing Examiner

- 1 -

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW, DECISION AND ORDER

1	FINDINGS OF FACT
2	1. Timothy Baerg currently resides within the Tacoma city limits at 821 South
3	Yakima Avenue #210, Tacoma, WA 98405. He owns a black and white spayed female
4	Husky name "Luna." ³ Baerg Testimony; Ex. R-1.
5	2. Animal Control issued a Potentially Dangerous Dog Notice for Luna dated
6	January 24, 2023 (the "PDDN"). The PDDN imposed restrictions on Luna. See Ex. R-1 for the
7	full list of restrictions originally imposed. Animal Control imposed these restrictions in
8	conformance with applicable provisions of the Tacoma Municipal Code ("TMC") and state
9	law. ⁴ O'Donnell Testimony; Ex. R-1.
10	3. The PDDN was issued as the result of an incident that occurred on December 29,
11	2022, at around 1:52 pm, in the underground parking garage of the St. James apartments at 821
12	South Yakima (the "Incident"). Gimse Testimony, Baerg Testimony; Exs. R-1 and, R-4.
13	4. At the time of the Incident, Mara Gimse was exiting the apartment building where
14	both she and Baerg reside in order to walk her Australian Shepard Zoey. She had entered the
15	underground parking garage on her way out, ⁵ and as she did so she saw Luna approaching her
16	and Zoey loose and apparently unaccompanied. Luna may have had on a leash, but no one was
17	controlling the leash or Luna at that point. Gimse Testimony; Ex. R-4.
18	5. Immediately prior, Luna had been with Baerg in the garage as he was working on
19	his vehicle. According to Baerg, Luna was on a leash and being restrained by Baerg's foot
20	
21	 ³ But see Finding of Fact ("FoF") 8 below. ⁴ TMC 17.01.010.27, TMC 17.04.050 and RCW 16.08. ⁵ During Appellant Baerg's cross-examination of Gimse, he began to make statements regarding whether Gimse was allowed to be in the parking garage. Because these were statements and not questions, and because the statements seemed to be based on hearsay, Baerg was cut off. During presentation of his own case, he offered no evidence on this topic, nor did he argue it again.

FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW, DECISION AND ORDER

holding the leash down, but somehow she got loose as Gimse and Zoey entered the garage.Baerg indicated that he had some of Luna's food on the floor while in the garage. *BaergTestimony*.

6. Luna approached Gimse and Zoey from approximately three parking stalls'
distance. Gimse yelled, "Get your dog!" as Luna approached, presuming Luna's owner to be
present in the garage, but Luna made it to her location and attacked Zoey. In the process, Gimse
fell and hit her head/face on one of the garage cement pillars. She landed between the dogs.
Somewhere along the way, Gimse saw Luna bite Zoey on her back/leg area. Eventually, Baerg
appeared and retrieved Zoey, ending any further physical contact between the dogs. Baerg did
not see what happened prior to his retrieving Luna. *Gimse Testimony, Baerg Testimony; Ex. R-*4.

7. Gimse went to urgent care shortly after the incident and was diagnosed with an acute concussion. *Gimse Testimony; Ex. R-6.* When Gimse returned home, she found Zoey bleeding and so took her to receive veterinary care. Zoey was found to have laceration wounds that required sutures, drainage, and medication. *Gimse Testimony; Ex. R-5.*

8. By his own admission, Baerg did not see Luna's attack on Zoey. Baerg testified that he does not believe Luna is a potentially dangerous dog, but he could not refute that the attack happened or provide any evidence of provocation.⁶ By the end of the hearing, Baerg indicated that Luna has been rehomed at present with his mother in Puyallup and that he is not contesting the restrictions imposed in the PDDN.

21

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW, DECISION AND ORDER

⁶ Baerg apparently made statements to Gimse about Luna's food having played some role in provoking the Incident, but the evidence admitted and testimony taken do not support that, if for no other reason than that Gimse and Zoey were never in close proximity to Luna's food before Luna approached them.

1	9. Any Conclusion of Law below which may be more properly deemed or considered
2	a Finding of Fact, is hereby adopted as such. Based upon the foregoing Findings of Fact, the
3	Hearing Examiner makes the following:
4	CONCLUSIONS OF LAW
5	1. The Hearing Examiner has jurisdiction in this matter pursuant to Tacoma
6	Municipal Code ("TMC") 1.23.050.B.8 and 17.04.032.
7	2. Pursuant to TMC 17.04.032.B, in appeal proceedings before the Hearing
8	Examiner challenging a Potentially Dangerous Dog declaration, Animal Control bears the
9	burden of proving, by a preponderance of the evidence, that the animal in question meets the
10	definition of a Potentially Dangerous Dog. This definition is as follows:
11	[A] "potentially dangerous dog" means any dog which:
12	a. unprovoked, bites or injures a human or domestic animal on public or private property; or
13	b. unprovoked, chases or approaches a person or domestic animal
14	upon the streets, sidewalks, or any public or private property in a menacing fashion or apparent attitude of attack; or
15	c. has a known propensity, tendency, or disposition to attack
16	unprovoked, to cause injury, or to otherwise threaten the safety of humans or domestic animals. <i>TMC</i> 17.01.010.27.
17	
18	3. The above criteria are disjunctive. As a result, the City must only prove that one
19	of the three criteria were met for a designation to be upheld on appeal. In the PDDN, Animal
20	Control checked subsection a. as the basis for issuance. Subsection a. is itself disjunctive in that
21	a dog can be found potentially dangerous if it "unprovoked, bites OR injures a human OR

FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW, DECISION AND ORDER City of Tacoma Office of the Hearing Examiner Tacoma Municipal Building 747 Market Street, Room 720 Tacoma, WA 98402-3768 Hearing.examiner@cityoftacoma.org Ph: (253) 591-5195 Fax: (253) 591-2003 domestic animal on public *OR* private property." [Emphasis added.] *TMC 17.01.010.27.a*; *Ex. R-1*.

4. When a dog is declared potentially dangerous, and that declaration is upheld after hearing, the Hearing Examiner has the authority to impose or revise conditions or restrictions in conformance with TMC Title 17 and RCW 16.08. *TMC 17.04.032, TMC 17.04.050*.

5. "Preponderance of the evidence" means that the trier of fact is convinced that it is
more probable than not that the fact(s) at issue is/are true.⁷ The preponderance of the evidence
standard is at the low end of the spectrum for burden-of-proof evidentiary standards in the U.S.
legal system, and is not particularly difficult to meet.⁸ Here, the material facts of the Incident
are not in dispute and the City's evidence meets the required burden.

6. The evidence in the record does show that Luna attacked Zoey without
provocation, and that both Gimse and Zoey were injured, thereby causing Luna to meet the
definition of being a potentially dangerous dog. *FoF 6 and 7*.

7. The restrictions imposed by Animal Control in the PDDN are appropriate here,
and as set forth above, were no longer contested by the time of the hearing's conclusion. *FoF 8*.
The Examiner sees no need to revise them. Restrictions such as those imposed here serve to
protect members of the community (and their pets) from dangerous behavior and attacks
because a dog so restricted should not be able to get loose and engage in dangerous behavior if
the restrictions are met, and even in cases where a dog gets loose, the muzzle should still
provide needed protection. The restrictions also serve to protect the life of the dog(s) so

21

20

⁷ Spivey v. City of Bellevue, 187 Wn.2d 716, 733, 389 P.3d 504, 512 (2017); State v. Paul, 64 Wn. App. 801, 807, 828 P.2d 594 (1992).

⁸ In re Custody of C.C.M., 149 Wn. App. 184, 202-203, 202 P.3d 971, 980 (2009); Mansour v. King County, 131 Wn. App. 255, 266, 128 P.3d 1241, 1246-1247 (2006).

FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW, DECISION AND ORDER

City of Tacoma Office of the Hearing Examiner Tacoma Municipal Building 747 Market Street, Room 720 Tacoma, WA 98402-3768 Hearing.examiner@cityoftacoma.org Ph: (253) 591-5195 Fax: (253) 591-2003

1	restricted from coming into possible greater jeopardy by preventing future incidents that could
2	lead to more severe consequences (such as euthanization, which is not at issue here).
3	8. Luna's relocation to Puyallup takes her out of the City's jurisdiction for so long as
4	she remains outside the city limits. FoF 8. This relocation notwithstanding, if Luna returns to
5	the city limits of Tacoma, she will be subject to the PDDN and the restrictions set forth therein
6	and herein.
7	9. Any Finding of Fact, which may be more properly deemed or considered a
8	Conclusion of Law, is hereby adopted as such.
9	Based upon the foregoing Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, the Hearing
10	Examiner issues the following:
11	ORDER
12	Based on the above Findings and Conclusions, the present appeal is DENIED and the
13	City of Tacoma's Potentially Dangerous Dog Notice issued to Luna is UPHELD.
14	Luna is subject to the following restrictions which must be adhered to at all times when Luna
15	is present in the city of Tacoma:
16	1) Luna must not be outside a proper enclosure on the premises of the owner, or be inside the premises of the owner; and
17	
18	2) Luna must not go beyond the proper enclosure on the premises of the owner unless she is securely leashed and humanely muzzled in a manner that will
19	prevent her from biting any person or animal and she must be under the physical control of a responsible person; and
20	3) A clearly visible warning sign informing that there is a potentially dangerous
21	dog on the property must be posted conspicuously and such sign must include a warning symbol that informs children of the presence of a potentially dangerous dog.
	FINDINGS OF FACT,City of TacomaCONCLUSIONS OF LAW,Office of the Hearing ExaminerDECISION AND ORDER- 6 -747 Market Street, Room 720Tacoma Wunicipal Building747 Market Street, Room 720Tacoma Wall

1	The following notification obligations of the PDDN also remain in full force and
2	effect:
3	The owner shall immediately notify Tacoma Animal Control, followed by written
4	notice, when a dog which has been classified as potentially dangerous:
5	A. is loose or unconfined; provided that, the owner shall first call 911;
6	B. has bitten a human being or attacked another animal; provided, the owner shall first call 911;
7	C. is sold or given away, or dies; or
8	D. is moved to another address.
9	The foregoing notification requirements are meant to apply if Luna is again within the
10	Tacoma city limits.
11	DATED this 22rd day of May 2022
12	DATED this 23rd day of May, 2023.
13	Child Call
14	JEFF H. CAPELL, Hearing Examiner
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
	FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW, DECISION AND ORDERCity of Tacoma Office of the Hearing Examiner Tacoma Municipal Building 747 Market Street, Room 720 Tacoma, WA 98402-3768 Hearing.examiner@cityoftacoma.org Ph: (253) 591-5195 Fax: (253) 591-2003

1	<u>NOTICE</u>
2	RECONSIDERATION/APPEAL OF EXAMINER'S DECISION
3	
4	RECONSIDERATION TO THE OFFICE OF THE HEARING EXAMINER:
5	Any aggrieved person or entity having standing under the ordinance governing the matter, or as otherwise provided by law, may file a motion with the Office of the Hearing Examiner requesting reconsideration of a decision or recommendation entered by the Examiner. A motion for reconsideration must be in writing and must set forth the alleged errors of procedure, fact, or law and must be filed in the Office of the Hearing Examiner within 14
6 7	
8	calendar days of the issuance of the Examiner's decision/recommendation, not counting the day of issuance of the decision/recommendation. If the last day for filing the motion for reconsideration falls on a weekend day or a holiday, the last day for filing shall be the next
9	working day. The requirements set forth herein regarding the time limits for filing of motions for reconsideration and contents of such motions are jurisdictional. Accordingly, motions for
10	reconsideration that are not timely filed with the Office of the Hearing Examiner or do not set forth the alleged errors shall be dismissed by the Examiner. It shall be within the sole
11	discretion of the Examiner to determine whether an opportunity shall be given to other parties for response to a motion for reconsideration. The Examiner, after a review of the matter, shall
12	take such further action as he/she deems appropriate, which may include the issuance of a revised decision/recommendation. (<i>Tacoma Municipal Code 1.23.140.</i>)
13	NOTICE
14	This matter may be appealed to Superior Court under applicable laws. If appealable, the
15	petition for review likely will have to be filed within thirty (30) days after service of the final Order from the Office of the Hearing Examiner.
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
	FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW, DECISION AND ORDERCity of Tacoma Office of the Hearing Examiner Tacoma Municipal Building 747 Market Street, Room 720 Tacoma, WA 98402-3768 Hearing.examiner@cityoftacoma.org Ph: (253) 591-5195 Fax: (253) 591-2003